

Equity and Trusts

Contents

1. History of Equity	7
The Earl of Oxford's Case (1615) 1 Ch Rep 1, 6; 21 ER 485, 486	7
Origins	7
Conflict between common law and equity	7
Reform and renewal	8
The maxims of Equity	10
<i>Corin v Patton</i> [1990] HCA 12; (1990) 169 CLR 540	10
<i>X v Twitter Inc</i> [2017] NSWSC 1300	11
2. Equitable remedies	12
Introduction to Equitable remedies	12
Examples of equitable remedies	12
Key features of equitable remedies	12
Interaction of equitable remedies and common law	12
<i>Giumelli v Giumelli</i> [1999] HCA 10; (1999) 196 CLR 101 (farm)	13
<i>McKenzie v McDonald</i> [1927] VLR 134 (estate agent)	13
<i>Nelson v Nelson</i> [1995] HCA 25; (1995) 184 CLR 538 (MoD housing)	15
What is a trust?	16
Parties to an express trust	17
Two main types of express trust	17
Key elements required to constitute an express trust	17
3. Equitable Property	18
Introduction to Equitable Property	18
Creation of equitable property rights / equitable interests in property	18
Nature of equitable ownership	19
Rights against rights	19
Equitable interests and equities	20
4. Fiduciary Relationships	26
Elements of a fiduciary obligation/relationship	26
Recognised fiduciary relationships	27
Status Based Fiduciary Relationships	27
Parent and child	27
Doctor and patient	27
Financial/ investment advisor and client	27
Ways of Identifying Fiduciary Relationships Ad Hoc	28
<i>Breen v Williams</i> (1996) (doctors, no)	28
<i>Daly v Sydney Stock Exchange Ltd</i> (1986) (stockbroker, yes)	28
<i>John Alexander's Clubs Pty Ltd v White City Tennis Club Ltd</i> (2010) (contract, depends)	29
<i>Wingecarribee Shire Council v Lehman Brothers Australia Ltd (in liq)</i> (2012) (financial advice, yes)	30
Duties imposed upon fiduciaries	31
Conflict rule (CBA v Smith 1991: hotel transaction) (Boardman v Phipps 1967)	31
Profit rule (Regal Hastings – cinemas)	34
Scope and breach (Howard v CT (2014))	34
“Vertical” fiduciary relationships (Hospital Products (1984)) – Agent, excluded oblig. Mason’s distill	36
“Horizontal” fiduciary relationships (United Dominions 1985) – JVer agreeing on the side	38
Concurrent contractual and fiduciary relationships – ASIC v Citigroup, fiduc excluded	39
Quality of disclosure and informed consent – Farah Construction / Queensland's Mines	41
Contracting out of Fiduciary Duties ASIC v Citigroup, fiduc excluded	42
How strict are fiduciary obligations? - infant lease / Boardman / Chan /	43
Remedies for breach of fiduciary obligations	45

5. Equitable Assignments	46
Property terminology in equity – chose in possession / chose in action / legal or equitable property	46
Assignment of legal property – possession / deed / statutory rule	47
Equity and legally ineffective assignments consideration / no consideration	47
The relevance of consideration – volunteers not assisted / specific performance / future property	47
Gifts (assignment) – Milroy v Lord (shares) / De Rose (time for tax) / Corin (transfer to brother)	48
Non-assignable rights (personal contracts / rights of action / contractually excluded / statute)	50
Future property (Norman FCT, uncertain future property / Shepherd FCT, assignment of rights)	51
Principles re agreements to assign and creation of equitable interest in favour of purchaser (Bahr Nicol)	52
Assignment of Equitable Property	53
Assignment of equitable property – the importance of intention	53
Assignment of equitable property – writing requirement (s23CA / Dunlop Rubber / Lind on Will)	53
Assignment of equitable property – exceptions to statutory writing requirements (12 months vacant)	56
Assignments of debts and choses in action (s 12 / FCT v Everett – assign share in partnership)	56
Principles from FCT v Everett	58
Direction to Trustee to hold for another	58
Summary of Assignments	60
6. The Concept of the Express Trust	61
Types of Trusts: Fixed vs Discretionary	61
Introduction to Express Trust	61
Trust v bailment	61
Trust or agency?	61
Discretionary objects: discretionary trust / trust power vs discretionary power / bare power	62
Similarities between trust powers and mere powers	63
Distinctions between trust powers and mere powers	63
Trust or charge	63
Trust or debt	64
Trust and contract	65
Wishes vs obligation	66
Definition of Express Trust	66
Some essential characteristics of the express trust	67
The rule in Saunders v Vautier (1841) 4 Beav 115 / 49 ER 282	67
The parties to a trust	67
Different types of trust	68
Certainty Requirement in Express Trusts	69
Certainty of Intention in Express Trusts	69
Express trusts: Objective or subjective intention?	71
Express trusts: Sham Trusts	71
Express trusts: intention to be proved	72
Express trusts: precatory trusts	72
Express trusts: Intention to create an immediate trust	73
Contract and trust: question of certainty of intention	74
Certainty of Subject Matter in Express Trusts	75
Certainty of Object Matter in Express Trusts	77
Express Trusts: Powers and certainty	78
Express Trusts: Conceptual and evidential uncertainty	78
Fixed trusts	79
Status of the criterion certainty test in Australia	79
Administrative unworkability	79
Certainty of objects and trustee's duties	80
Executing a trust power	80
Trusts and public policy	81
Valid trust for a purpose	81
Methods of creating an express trust	81
Self-declaration of a trust	82

Formalities for <i>inter vivos</i> trusts by declaration	82
Trusts created by transfer	83
Formalities for <i>inter vivos</i> trusts by transfer (The cloak of fraud doctrine)	83
Testamentary Trusts	84
The doctrine of incorporation by reference	84
Incompletely constituted trusts	85
Non-simultaneous declaration and vesting	85
Public Policy Issues with Enforcement	85
7. Trustee's Powers and Duties	86
Sources of the trustee's duties and powers	86
Duties on assumption of trusteeship	86
Duty to adhere to the terms of the trust	86
Duty to 'get in' the trust assets	86
Ongoing management duties	87
Investment of trust funds	87
Professional Trustee's duty of investment (s 14A(2)(a))	87
Non-professional Trustee's duty of investment (s 14A(2)(b))	87
Trustee's Investment Duty (s 14B and 14C)	87
Matters to which a Trustee must have regard to when exercising Power of Investment (s 14C)	88
Investment advice for the Trustee (s 14(2))	88
Court can assess investment strategy (section 90)	88
Duty to comply with the Trust Deed	88
Duty to Act with Reasonable Prudence and Care	89
Duty to Seek Advice	89
Duty to Act in the Interests of Beneficiaries	89
Duty to Act impartially	89
Duty to Avoid Conflicts of Interest	90
Duty not to Profit from a Trust	90
Trustee remuneration	90
Dealing with Trust Property for Trustees own Benefit	90
Duty not to Purchase Trust Property	90
Duty not to Lend Money to Itself	90
Duty to Act Personally	90
Non-delegation	91
Not acting under dictation	91
Not fettering discretion	91
Acting unanimously	91
Duty to Consider Whether to Exercise a Discretionary Power	92
Duty to keep assets separate	92
Keeping and rendering accounts	92
Duty to give information to beneficiaries	92
Information concerning entitlements	92
Other information concerning the trust	93
Memoranda or letters of wishes	93
Access by beneficiaries to trust documents	94
Duty of Care	94
Appointing agents	95
Duty to consider exercise of powers	95
Particular aspects of the trustee's fiduciary obligations	95
The duty to act gratuitously	95
The self-dealing rule	95
The fair dealing rule	96
Duties on winding up a trust	96
Trusts and Powers	96
Trustee's powers	97
Exercise of power and review	97

Exercise of power and review in superannuation trusts	99
Effect of improper exercise of discretion	100
8. Trustees' Rights and Liabilities & Breach of Trust	101
Trustee's liabilities	101
Trustee's right of indemnity	101
The status of the trustee's right of indemnity	101
Calculating the value of the trustee's right of indemnity	104
Reasonable expenses (Trustee's right of indemnity)	104
Can the trustee's right to indemnity out of trust assets be excluded by the trust instrument?	105
Third parties and the trustee's right of indemnity	105
Indemnification by the beneficiaries	106
Creditor's rights to be subrogated to the trustee's personal indemnification by beneficiaries	107
Trustee's right to impound beneficiary's interest	107
Trustee's right of contribution from co-trustees	107
Trustee's right to recover overpayment from a beneficiary	108
Defences and remedies of the Trustee	108
Exculpation in the trust instrument	108
Exculpation of Trustees in the Statute	110
Wilful default	110
The general statutory defence	110
Equitable defences for the Trustee in the event of breach of Trust	111
Consent as defence from breach of trust	112
Acquiescence and release as defence from breach of trust	112
Remedies in the context of breach of trust	113
Monetary remedies for breach of trust	113
Unauthorised profits	113
Prohibited breaches	113
Negligence in performance	113
Compensation for breach of conflicts rule	114
Statutory provisions related to monetary remedies for breach of trust	114
Non-monetary remedies for breach of trust	115
Standing to sue for breach of trust	115
9. Tracing	116
Key concepts of tracing	118
Tracing and claiming at common law and in equity	118
Tracing stolen property	119
The equitable tracing rules	119
Mixing money in a bank account	119
Backwards Tracing	126
Defences to equitable tracing claims	126
10. Priorities	127
Priority disputes and the doctrine of notice	127
Registration (priorities)	127
First: legal interest v Second: legal interest	127
First: legal interest v Second: equitable interest	128
First: equitable interest v Second: legal interest	128
First: equitable interest v Second: equitable interest	128
First: mere equity v Second: equitable interest	131
Priorities cheatsheet	133
11. Personal Liability of Accessories/Recipients	134
Third party liability: the rule in Barnes v Addy	134
Liability for knowing receipt	135
What type of knowledge (re knowing receipt)?	136
Remedies for knowing receipt	138
Liability for knowing assistance	138
Remedies for knowing assistance	141

Other forms of participatory liability	141
Claims based on tracing	141
Inducing a breach of trust	141
Trusteeship de son tort	141
12. Remedies: Compulsion	142
The objectives of equitable remedies	142
Equitable remedies: coercion	142
Equitable remedies: compensation	142
Equitable remedies: disgorgement	142
Equitable remedies: restitution	142
Equitable remedies: nullification	143
Equitable remedies: Reformation	143
Equitable remedies: Vindication	143
Remedies: specific performance	143
Specific performance: fairness to both parties	143
Specific performance: supervision	144
Particular kinds of contracts and supervision	145
Particular kinds of contracts and supervision: construction contracts	145
Particular kinds of contracts and supervision: performance of personal services	145
Prerequisites to award specific performance	146
Prerequisites to award specific performance: specifically enforceable contracts	147
Prerequisites to award specific performance: valuable consideration	147
Prerequisites to award specific performance: inadequacy of damages	147
Bars to specific performance	148
Compulsion: injunctions	148
The jurisdiction to award injunctions	149
The criteria for the award of an injunction	149
Plaintiff's remedy if specific performance or injunction are denied	150
Accounts of profits	150
How are accounts of profits calculated?	150
Accounts of profits: allowances	151
Equitable compensation	152
Emergence of jurisdiction to award equitable compensation	152
How is equitable compensation calculated?	153
Calculating equitable compensation for breach of trust	153
Calculating equitable compensation for breach of fiduciary duty	154
13. Non Consensual Trusts: Resulting Trusts	156
Introduction to Resulting Trusts	156
Failure of an express trust	156
Presumed Resulting Trust	157
Purchase of property in another person's name	157
An Institutional Trust	157
The presumption of advancement	157
Application of the presumptions to family property	158
Voluntary transfers of property	160
Resulting trusts arising on failure of an express trust	160
Resulting trusts arising in other cases of failure of basis: the Quistclose trust	160
14. Non Consensual Trust: Constructive Trust [not to avoid unjust enrichment!!!]	162
Introduction to Constructive Trust	162
Constructive Trust: remedy or institution?	162
The constructive trust compared with other trusts	163
Categories and principles of constructive trust	164
Constructive trusts and unjust enrichment (not in Australia)	164
Constructive trusts and unconscionability	164
Constructive trusts and wrongdoing	164
The "common intention" constructive trust and family property disputes	165

Common intention in the common intention constructive trusts. Allen v Snyder (1977) de facto couple;	165
Detriment in reliance in the common intention constructive trusts. Green v Green (1989) Bangkok	166
Date of effect in the common intention constructive trusts. Parsons v McBain (2001)	166
The Baumgartner constructive trust	167
Assessing contributions in the Baumgartner constructive trust	167
Equitable adjustments in the Baumgartner constructive trust	168
The constructive trust as a remedy for estoppel	168
Constructive trusts imposed for breach of fiduciary obligation	168
The constructive trust imposed over stolen money and its proceeds	169
The constructive trust as a restitutionary remedy for unjust enrichment	169
The doctrine of mutual wills	170
Constructive trusts imposed over property transferred under specifically enforceable contracts	170
15. Bars to relief	171
Introduction to Bars to relief	171
Bars to relief: laches	171
Bars to relief: acquiescence	172
Bars to relief: unclean hands	173
Bars to relief: hardship	174
Effect of the order on third parties	175
May the Court consider hardship to third parties as a discretionary factor?	176